



TOLLCROSS
housing association

Governing Body Performance Review Policy

Prepared By	Anne Wilson, Corporate Services Director
Policy Created	March 2014
Date of Last Review	28 th June 2021
Date of Current Review	27 th March 2023
Date of Next Review	March 2028
Reviewed By	Management Committee

CORPORATE FIT

Internal Management Plan	✓
Risk Register	✓
Business Plan	✓
Regulatory Standards	✓
Equalities Strategy	✓
Legislation	✓

On request, the Association can provide translations of all our documents, policies and procedures in various languages and other formats such as computer disc, tape, large print, Braille etc. and these can be obtained by contacting the Association's offices.

CONTENTS

1. Introduction
2. Regulatory and Best Practice Framework
3. Equalities Statement
4. Performance Review
5. Measuring Existing Skills, Identifying Gaps and the Training Needs Analysis
6. Long-Serving Committee Members
7. Appraising the Chair
8. Newly Appointed Committee Members
9. Annual Timetable
10. Policy Review

Appendices

Appendix 1 - Governing Body Self Assessment Form

Appendix 2 - Individual Appraisal Form

Appendix 3 - Long-Serving Members Form

Appendix 4 - Chair's Review

Appendix 5 - Newly Appointed Committee Members Form

1. Introduction

This document outlines the Association's approach to measuring Committee performance and continued effectiveness, training needs and arrangements for dealing with long-serving Committee members. It sets out a formal framework to help ensure that we continue to meet regulatory expectations. It is supported by a suite of templates and pro formas that will help ensure that our approach is clear and consistent.

2. Regulatory & Best Practice Framework

- 2.1 This policy takes account of regulatory and best practice requirements, including standard 6 of the Regulatory Standards of Governance and Financial Management and the Code of Conduct for Governing Body Members.
- 2.2 The Scottish Federation of Housing Associations (SFHA) has developed a governance handbook in consultation with a reference group (consisting of representatives from RSLs and other interested parties) with the Scottish Housing Regulator (SHR).
- 2.3 This policy takes account of the Regulatory Standards and we believe that these have been accurately reflected in this policy.
- 2.4 In addition to the relevant chapters in the governance handbook, Employers in Voluntary Housing (EVH) issued guidance on Committee appraisal, *Great Expectations*, and this has been used in the development of this policy document. In particular, *Great Expectations* identifies three elements of Committee appraisal:
 - Measuring the Committee's collective performance
 - Individual Committee member performance
 - Appraising the Chair

Sections 6 and 7 of this policy take account of these components.

3. Equalities

- 3.1 An Equality Impact Assessment (EIA) has been carried out when reviewing this policy. In line with good practice the completed EIA will be published alongside the Governing Body Performance Review Policy.
- 3.2 Where there is a need for follow-up action, the tasks and timeframe for achieving them shall be noted in the Equality and Human Rights Action Plan to ensure they are addressed.
- 3.3 We do not see this policy as having any direct impact upon the protected characteristics contained within the Equality Act 2010.

4. Performance Review

4.1 In order to help comply with the Regulatory Standards, the Association will carry out an annual review of its own performance and an individual committee member's effectiveness review. There are six strands to the Performance Review.

- 1) The Committee performance review
- 2) The individual Committee member effectiveness review,
- 3) The continued effectiveness review for longer serving committee members
- 4) 360° Chairpersons review
- 5) Newly appointed Committee member feedback
- 6) Bi annual training needs analysis (TNA).

4.2 The Committee performance review and individual Committee member effectiveness review will take the form of a one to one meeting with the Chairperson or independent assessor, following the completion of an on-line survey. The Chairperson and assessor shall alternate each year. The Corporate Services Director will assist in the co-ordination of the on-line survey forms and the review meetings.

Committee will be provided access to the forms at least two weeks prior to the meeting so that participants can give the questions some consideration and be better prepared before the meeting. The Corporate Services Director will retain the completed forms for audit trail purposes on a confidential basis.

This will enable the Committee to: -

- Identify any areas that we can strengthen when promoting and/or targeting individuals for Committee membership in advance of the Annual General Meeting, and
- Discuss and assess the requirements for an individual training plan.

4.3 The performance review process has the following important roles:

- a) To help identify any areas in performance that could be improved by attracting individuals with a particular skill set. For example, if a Committee considered its performance to be very poor in relation to financial or budgetary matters, it may be appropriate to consider targeted recruitment of someone with financial knowledge/experience.

- b) To assist in succession planning. It is critical that the Association has a clear method of ensuring that Committee members who may be interested in being an Officer Bearer or Chairperson has the appropriate support and training to prepare them for these important roles.
 - c) To help identify training requirements and therefore feed in to the training needs assessment which will be undertaken bi annually.
- 4.4 Appendix 1 contains details of the survey form to be used in the Management Committee performance review.
- 4.5 Appendix 2 contains the details of the survey form to be used in the Individual Committee member performance review.
- 4.6 The results of the annual Committee and Committee member reviews will be evaluated by the Chairperson or independent assessor, in conjunction with the Corporate Services Director and Committee with an appropriate follow-up action plan agreed by Committee at the May and August Committee meetings respectively.

5. Assessing Existing Skills, Identifying Gaps & the Training Needs Assessment

- 5.1 The Association has a long established practice of assessing the skills, knowledge and experience present within the Committee group in order to help ensure that (i) all of the key skills and knowledge areas are covered and that (ii) members are able to keep up-to-date with evolving legal, regulatory and best practice requirements.
- 5.2 As well as identifying the skills present within the Committee, the assessment also highlights any gaps that exist. These gaps can then be prioritised and addressed via a training plan which consists, in the main, of training sessions taking place in the Association's office, led by staff or external trainers. Where a small number of members have a specific need, such as chairing skills or interviewing skills, this may be addressed by attending an external session.
- 5.3 The skills analysis will highlight areas where training is required. This will be done at a bi annual session to be held between April and June each year.
- 5.4 The output from the TNA will be a two-year training plan. Preparations of the first training plan commenced during the summer of 2013 and this has been developed over the years, taking account of the outcome of the completion of Committee and individual Committee review forms.

6. Long-Serving Committee Members

- 6.1 Regulatory Standard 6.3 requires all Committee members wishing to serve beyond nine years to demonstrate their contribution and effectiveness. Whilst we are keen to comply with this Standard, we equally endorse the general assertion that “automatically regarding longer serving members as somehow less effective is, at best subjective and insulting, and at worst (given that they may also tend to be older) potentially discriminatory. So for the avoidance of doubt it is a useful reminder to us all that there is no empirical evidence to support any of the following crude assumptions.”
- 6.2 The Association believes that members attaining nine years’ experience as a Committee member will have amassed a huge amount of skills, experience and knowledge, not only in terms of functional/technical subjects but also in relation to being able to contribute in an increasingly effective manner.
- 6.3 Appendix 3 has been prepared as a template to be used when an individual is considering standing for election after nine years’ service. This was initially used in 2015 when this requirement came into effect. It will be completed by the Committee member (on-line where possible) and an independent assessor at a meeting arranged for this purpose. The Corporate Services Director will ensure the content of the completed forms and follow up report provided by the assessor will be confidential.
- 6.4 The Regulator requires Committee members serving for more than nine years to be able to show (i) objectivity, (ii) independent challenge and (iii) continued effectiveness. The template allows each of these to be demonstrated via a series of questions/pointers – these should be considered by the independent assessor and the Committee member and an overall view taken of each of the three sections.
- 6.5 Once a Committee member has completed a review, they will not be expected to do so every year. However, they will be required to show their continued effectiveness every time they are up for election due to it being their “turn” to stand down in line with the rule that requires one third of the Committee to stand down each year. This means that, on average, members will need to show their continued effectiveness every three years after their first nine years.

This review will take the form of a one to one with an independent assessor.

7. Appraising the Chair

- 7.1 As with other elements of this policy, the Association is formalising and building upon something that already exists, albeit in a less structured way. For example, the Chair receives particular training to help them fulfil their role, they receive ongoing feedback from the Chief Executive and, importantly, they are subject to a form of peer review when they are elected as Chair.
- 7.2 *Great Expectations* recommends an approach called “360° appraisal” and this will form the basis of the Chair’s annual assessment. 360° appraisal involves the Chair completing a self-assessment (similar to the self-assessment process carried out by all Committee members in preparation for the annual group session) in addition to an assessment of the Chair being carried out by the other Committee members.
- 7.3 A simple pro forma (Appendix 4) contains a range of key statements with which each Committee member agrees or disagrees. Additional comments can also be added, but this is not necessary. The report from on-line completion of the forms will be passed to the Chief Executive in advance of an annual meeting with the Chair – the forms can be anonymous or, where the Committee member provides their name, this will be treated in complete confidence by the Chief Executive. The Chief Executive will then assess the forms and provide feedback to the Chair at the annual meeting.
- 7.4 The assessment will be carried out by the Chief Executive and the output will be an action plan comprising (i) any specific training required and (ii) any changes in approach to certain areas that have been highlighted and agreed during the meeting. Feedback to the Committee as a whole will be limited to the fact that the meeting has taken place and an action plan has been agreed. The detail of the meeting will remain confidential.
- 7.5 The annual review meeting with the Chair should take place nearer the end of the Governing Body review process, i.e. before the end of June .

8. Newly Appointed Committee Members

During the year the Association may recruit new members to join the Committee. In line with policy, they shall receive a robust induction and be assigned a mentor from the Management Committee. The new members shall be asked to complete a separate questionnaire in order to provide feedback on their experience of the Committee and to suggest any training gaps they feel should be addressed. Appendix 5 outlines the questionnaire that shall be issued. Depending on the length of service of the new Committee member, they may be asked to complete the assessment of the Chair (Appendix 4).

Tollcross Housing Association

Governing Body Performance Review Policy

9. Performance Review Timetable

The following table outlines the annual timetable of meetings:

Month	Meeting	Attendees	Output
April - June annually	Annual review of Management Committee performance – completed on-line where possible and followed up in person	All Committee members	Assessment by Chairperson or independent assessor on performance of organisation (Chair and assessor shall alternate role and be supported by the Corporate Services Director)
April – June annually	Individual committee member effectiveness review - completed on-line, where possible and followed up in person	All Committee members	Self assessment completed and returned to the Chair or independent assessor and held in confidence for audit trail (Chair and assessor shall alternate role and be supported by the Corporate Services Director)
April – June annually	Long-standing members who are standing for election at that year's AGM shall complete the form on-line where possible and a meeting will be followed up in person.	Independent assessor and individual Committee member concerned.	Details of meeting will be confidential but the independent report will confirm whether objectivity, independent challenge and continued effectiveness has been shown
June annually	Management Committee meeting to evaluate outcome of long-standing Committee performance review	All Committee members and independent assessor	Recommendations about individuals' ability to proceed to AGM
April – June annually	Newly appointed Management Committee members shall complete an on-line questionnaire to offer feedback on their experience of the Committee and their own effectiveness	Committee member and Chair or independent assessor	Assessment completed and returned to the Chair or independent assessor and held in confidence. The Corporate Services Director shall provide support.
April - June Annually	Appraisal of the Chair Committee members shall complete an on-line (where possible) assessment of the Chair. The Chair shall complete an on-line self-assessment	Chair, Vice-Chair, Secretary, Chief Executive and independent assessor	Confidential feedback to the Chair and confirmation to the Committee that the meeting has taken place
April-June bi annually	Skills assessment/ training needs analysis	Committee members	Report by the Corporate Services Director or independent assessor and training programme agreed for ensuing two years.

10. Policy Review

This policy shall be reviewed every five years unless it is deemed necessary to review earlier.



APPENDIX 1 (Form 1)

Governing Body Self Assessment Form: Confidential

Name

Is there any support which could be provided to support your attendance?
--

How long have you been on the committee?
--

What about being on the committee gives you most satisfaction?
--

What do you consider your role as a committee member to be?

How would you like your role to develop in the future? (e.g. office bearer role, involvement in policy development / particular area of work, etc.)

Do you intend to remain on the committee after the AGM?	YES	NO
---	------------	-----------

Would you be interested in becoming an office bearer?	YES	NO
---	------------	-----------

Would you be interested in chairing future Sub-Committee or Management Committee meetings?	YES	NO
--	------------	-----------

Tollcross Housing Association
 Governing Body Performance Review Policy

Area of work	The Committee is performing.....			
	Very Well	Well	Poorly	Very Poorly
The committee leads the association and sets its strategic direction				
Comment (optional):				
AREA OF WORK	Very Well	Well	Poorly	Very Poorly
The committee operates as a team and ensures shared responsibility for all decisions.				
Comment (optional):				
AREA OF WORK	Very Well	Well	Poorly	Very Poorly
The committee makes decisions effectively.				
Comment (optional):				
AREA OF WORK	Very Well	Well	Poorly	Very Poorly
The Committee manages risk to the organisation.				
Comment (optional):				
AREA OF WORK	Very Well	Well	Poorly	Very Poorly
The committee effectively holds senior officers to account.				
Comment (optional):				
AREA OF WORK	Very Well	Well	Poorly	Very Poorly
The committee protects the Association's assets, oversees budgetary and financial decisions.				
Comment (optional):				

Tollcross Housing Association Governing Body Performance Review Policy

AREA OF WORK	Very Well	Well	Poorly	Very Poorly
The Management Committee encourages appropriate involvement of tenants in the planning and decision-making process.				
Comment (optional):				
AREA OF WORK	Very Well	Well	Poorly	Very Poorly
The Management Committee Chair and CEO encourages and supports the contributions of Management Committee members.				
Comment (optional):				

Section 3 Training information and feedback (continued)

Please check you rating of your skills / knowledge from last year's appraisal in the following areas. If any of these have changed, please amend them

Select the appropriate rating for each statement	Strongly Agree	Agree	Somewhat agree	Do not agree
I understand the role Scottish Housing Regulator				
I understand the role of internal and external audit				
I understand the importance of Assurance statements and the committee's role in completing these				
I am aware of the various returns the association makes to the Scottish Housing Regulator (i.e. Annual return on the Charter (ARC))				
I am aware of Notifiable Events and the expectations it places on committee and staff members				
I am aware of Whistleblowing and the expectations it places on committee and staff members				
I am aware of the key Equalities legislation and regulation and the expectations they place on committee and staff members				
I understand the following main Governance documents: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Code of conduct • Entitlements, Payments and benefits policy • The Committee's Recruitment, Succession and Annual Governance Review policies and procedures • The Committee's induction policy and procedure 				
I understand the expectation for all committee members to participate in discussions, and contribute to decisions and not be unduly influenced by any groups/organisations (i.e. political parties, pressure groups)				
I understand the Committee can receive independent specialist advice to inform its decisions (e.g. pensions advice, business planning advice, etc.)				
I understand the need for all committee members to accept collective responsibility for decisions made by the committee				

Key areas of work

Select the appropriate rating for each statement	Strongly Agree	Agree	Somewhat agree	Do not agree
I have a good understanding of Housing Management (i.e. allocations, rent setting, rent arrears, etc.)				
I have a good understanding of Maintenance (i.e. reactive repairs, cyclical maintenance, etc.)				
I have good understanding of Development (i.e. development funding, development plans, etc.)				
I have a good understanding of Finance (i.e. treasury management, financial covenants, budgets, rent setting, etc.)				
I have a good understanding of the committee's role as an employer of staff				

Sub-committees – How well are they performing?

Please feedback on each of the sub-committees you serve on.

Operation Sub-Committee

How long have you served on it?

Are you the sub-committee convenor? YES/NO

How effectively does the sub-committee perform? Is there anything which could be done to improve this sub-committee?

Audit and Business Sub-Committee

How long have you served on it?

Are you the sub-committee convenor? YES/NO

How effectively does the sub-committee perform? Is there anything which could be done to improve this sub-committee?



Tollcross Housing Association Governing Body Performance Review Policy

Do you feel there are any specific training/support needs for the Management Committee?

What additional members / skills would benefit the committee?



TOLLCROSS
housing association

APPENDIX 2 (Form 2)

Individual Appraisal Interview Questions

1. GENERAL OVERVIEW

What gives you most satisfaction / helps you remain on the committee?

What areas of the committee / Tollcross's work do you find most interesting?

Have you been frustrated / disappointed by any aspect of your involvement in the past year?

Do you think there are any specific training gaps for you?

Is the balance correct between local and 'external' people on the committee?

How well do you think the committee has operated over the last year?

Do you feel that you have access to sufficient information to take informed decisions?

Are there any reports you particularly like – Why? Are there any reports you dislike why?

Is there anything you would change about reports?

Do you have any comments about electronic reports?

Do you have any comments on the MS Teams meetings? Do you need any further support?

What are the key issues which are most important to Tollcross and its tenants?

Does the committee lead, or does it follow?

Do the Committee challenge staff enough, ask difficult questions? Does the staff encourage this?

Do you have any comments about the Appraisal process?

What else would you have liked me to ask? What should I ask other members?



Appendix 3 (Form 3) Long Serving Members

Tollcross Housing Association

Governing Body Performance Review Policy

Long Serving Members

Committee members with nine or more consecutive years' service on the Management Committee should answer the following sections to demonstrate their: objectivity; challenge and effectiveness on the Committee, which will allow the Management Committee to decide whether they continue to be effective in the role and allow them to stand for election at the next Annual General Meeting

In this section you are asked to rate your effectiveness in your performance as a long term Committee member:

1 = you are not effective or performing well in this aspect of your role.

4 = you are very effective and performing well in this aspect of your role.

(a) Objectivity

Please mark with a 'X'

		1	2	3	4
i)	I maintain a professional and constructive relationship with fellow Committee members, the CEO and senior staff members				
ii)	I can separate personal issues and feelings in discussions and decisions of the Management Committee				
iii)	I'm able to establish when to request independent support, evidence or validation to support the Committee's work and decision making.				
iv)	I'm confident in assessing the association's performance and benchmarking this against other associations activities (to compare our performance against others in the sector)				
v)	I am focussed on my role to ensure the Association meets its objectives and good outcomes for tenants and other customers				
Please detail evidence or examples to support your scoring in this section					

b) Challenge

Please mark with a 'X'

		1	2	3	4
i)	I'm able to constructively challenge other Committee members' views I do not agree with				
ii)	I'm able to challenge Committee members and senior staff members in a non-confrontational manner				
iii)	I continue to contribute effectively to Committee discussions and decisions as I have in recent years				
iv)	I am fully aware and embrace the Association's mission, values and objectives				
v)	I have a good understanding of the needs and aspirations of our tenants and other customers.				
vii)	I have a good awareness of the process and outcomes of the appraisal of the CEO.				
Please detail evidence or examples to support your scoring in this section					

c) Effectiveness

Please mark with a 'X'

		1	2	3	4
i)	How would you rate your current levels of commitment, enthusiasm and interest on the Committee compared to 3 years ago				
ii)	You attend training events, seminars and conferences to enhance your knowledge and skills to be effective in your role.				
iii)	You have positive relationships and network with other Committee members in other organisations and Tollcross's PIN / PILs				
iv)	Outline how you keep up to date with current issues facing the sector?				
v)	What do you see as the 3 biggest challenges facing the Association in coming years? 1. 2. 3.				
vi)	If you see yourself continuing to be a Committee member, what strengths and attributes do you bring to the Committee				
vii)	What support or assistance could you bring to new or less experienced members on the Management Committee? (e.g. mentoring or buddying new members)				
Please detail evidence or examples to support your scoring in this section					



APPENDIX 4 (Form 4)

Chair’s Review - 360° Assessment Form

Please rate the Chair’s performance against the various statements below using the following scale:

Rating	Icon
I am happy with the Chair’s level of ability in this area	☺
Something that I think the Chair may be able to improve on	☹

Chair’s assessment	Rating	
	☺	☹
I BELIEVE THAT THE CHAIR GENERALLY		
Prepares well for meetings		
Represents the organisation positively		
Listens to others		
Chairs meetings appropriately		
Does not allow individuals to dominate meetings		
Is enthusiastic about the organisation		
Shows a good level of commitment		
Demonstrates a good team working attitude with Committee members and senior staff		
Leads the Committee appropriately		
Overall what do you see as the Chair’s main skills/ strengths and the main areas where you feel that there might be room for further improvement?		



TOLLCROSS
housing association

APPENDIX 5 (Form 5)

Newly Appointed Members

1. GENERAL OVERVIEW

Tell us a bit about yourself – work history, committee skills, etc.

Why did you decide to join the Tollcross Committee – was there anything specific about Tollcross?

Moving forward what do you see your role on the committee being?

From the meetings you've attended so far has anything surprised you about the committee or the association?

Have you been effectively supported as a new member? What support have you had? Would anything else have been useful?

Is there any other training or support you would like?

Do you have any comments on the MS Teams meetings? Do you need any further support?



Tollcross Housing Association Governing Body Performance Review Policy

What skills, in your opinion, make up a good committee – what are your first impressions of the Tollcross team?

Do the Committee challenge staff enough, ask difficult questions? Do the staff encourage this?

Is there anything you would like to know?